

**Public Document Pack**  
**MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee**  
**Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on**  
**Tuesday, 5th November, 2024 at 2.00 pm**

**PRESENT:** County Councillor Phil Murphy (Chair)  
County Councillor Dale Rooke (Vice-Chair)

County Councillors: Jill Bond, Fay Bromfield, Emma Bryn, Jan Butler,  
John Crook, Tony Easson, Meirion Howells, Su McConnel,  
Jayne McKenna, Maureen Powell, Sue Riley, and Ann Webb

**OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:**

Craig O'Connor	Head of Placemaking
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Andrew Jones	Development Management Area Team Manager
Amy Longford	Development Management Area Team Manager
Paige Moseley	Solicitor
Richard Ray	Paralegal
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

County Councillor Jayne McKenna joined the meeting following determination of application DM/2024/00985.

County Councillor Fay Bromfield left the meeting following determination of application DM/202400845 and did not return.

**APOLOGIES:**

County Councillor Sara Burch

**1. Declarations of Interest**

County Councillor Phil Murphy declared a personal, non-prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' code of conduct in respect of application DM/2024/00985, as his son used to work with the applicant.

County Councillor Meirion Howells declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' code of conduct in respect of application DM/2023/01679, as he is a pacifist. He therefore left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon in respect of this application.

<https://www.youtube.com/live/r5JUTxRgl-4?si=gb9t5xftpNvKoAeXX&t=169>

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee  
Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on  
Tuesday, 5th November, 2024 at 2.00 pm**

### **2. Confirmation of Minutes**

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 1<sup>st</sup> October 2024 were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

<https://www.youtube.com/live/r5JUTxRgl-4?si=np8NbdgMfA6meNid&t=200>

### **3. Application DM/2023/01341 - Construction of a New Dwelling. 33 Maryport Street, Usk, NP15 1AE**

Consideration of application DM/2023/01341 was deferred to a future meeting of the Planning Committee to allow officers to address issues raised in respect of the site and the impact on neighbours.

<https://www.youtube.com/live/r5JUTxRgl-4?si=98aQ0wTrjXcpmGsK&t=257>

### **4. Application DM/2023/01679 - Construction of a building to house munitions assembly, extraction of material from borrow pits for construction of surrounding blast mounds. B A E Systems, Glascoed Rof, NP15 1XL**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

<https://www.youtube.com/live/r5JUTxRgl-4?si=h6BfJDTkajBmTSrt&t=274>

In noting the detail of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor Maureen Powell and seconded by County Councillor Dale Rooke that application DM/2023/01679 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	7
Against approval	-	1
Abstentions	-	2

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2023/01679 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

### **5. Application DM/2024/00985 - Replacement dwelling. Bushes Farm, Chapel Road, Earlswood, Shirenewton**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was presented for refusal for the reasons outlined in the report. However, it was considered that reason two for refusal should be omitted.

<https://www.youtube.com/live/r5JUTxRgl-4?si=h2WG-lbR9ddX8NH2&t=1181>

**MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee  
Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on  
Tuesday, 5th November, 2024 at 2.00 pm**

In noting the detail of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor Maureen Powell and seconded by County Councillor Emma Bryn that application DM/2024/00985 be refused for Reason 1, outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	6
Against refusal	-	6
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was tied.

Therefore, the Chair exercised his casting vote and voted to refuse the application for Reason 1, outlined in the report. The proposition was therefore carried.

We resolved that application DM/2024/00985 be refused for Reason 1, outlined in the report.

**6. Application DM/2024/00845 - Proposed rear extension and front porch extension. 4 Tanglewood Close, Abergavenny, NP7 5RJ**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence in which the officer recommendation was split, as follows:

Rear Extension: Refuse for the one reason outlined in the report with an amendment to remove any reference to privacy.

Porch: Approve subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

<https://www.youtube.com/live/r5JUTxRgl-4?si=Jzvu3g1p8NIPkqt&t=3962>

In noting the detail of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor Maureen Powell and seconded by County Councillor Su McConnel that we support the officer recommendation as follows:

Rear Extension: Refuse for the one reason outlined in the report with an amendment to remove any reference to privacy.

Porch: Approve subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the officer recommendation	-	11
Against the officer recommendation	-	2
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 5th November, 2024 at 2.00 pm

We resolved to support the officer recommendation in respect of application DM/2024/00845 as follows:

Rear Extension: Refuse for the one reason outlined in the report with an amendment to remove any reference to privacy.

Porch: Approve subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

#### **7. FOR INFORMATION - The Planning Inspectorate - Appeals / Costs Decisions Received:**

<https://www.youtube.com/live/r5JUTxRgl-4?si=DS1cFRI6-pCw7F2S&t=5848>

##### **7.1. Appeal Decision - 17 St Mary Street, Chepstow, Monmouthshire, NP16 5EW**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been held at 17 St Mary Street, Chepstow, Monmouthshire on 9<sup>th</sup> September 2024.

We noted that the appeal had been dismissed.

##### **7.2. Appeal Decision - Former Whitemill Welsh Water Works, Usk Road, Shirenewton, Monmouthshire, NP16 6BU**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been held at Former Whitemill Welsh Water Works, Usk Road, Shirenewton, Monmouthshire on 9<sup>th</sup> September 2024.

We noted that the appeal had been dismissed.

##### **7.3. Appeal Decision - Land North West Of Holly Lodge (also known as Land at High Mass Cottage and Land at Church View), Five Lanes North, Five Lanes, Caerwent, Monmouthshire NP26 5PG**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been held at Land North West Of Holly Lodge (also known as Land at High Mass Cottage and Land at Church View), Five Lanes North, Five Lanes, Caerwent, Monmouthshire on 24<sup>th</sup> September 2024.

#### **Appeal A**

We noted that subject to the corrections and variations outlined in the Inspector's report, Appeal A was dismissed, and the enforcement notice was upheld.

#### **Appeal B**

We noted that the appeal was allowed and planning permission was granted for change of use from agriculture to land for the keeping of horses (retrospective), proposed

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee

Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on  
Tuesday, 5th November, 2024 at 2.00 pm

erection of stable block for 5 horses, erection of ancillary storage building, construction of manege, at Land North West Of Holly Lodge (also known as Land at High Mass Cottage and Land at Church View), Five Lanes North, Five Lanes, Caerwent, Monmouthshire NP26 5PG, in accordance with the terms of the application, reference DM/2023/01042, dated 24 July 2023, subject to the conditions set out in the schedule.

**7.4. Costs Decision - Land North West Of Holly Lodge (also known as Land at High Mass Cottage and Land at Church View), Five Lanes North, Five Lanes, Caerwent, Monmouthshire NP26 5PG**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to the costs decision in respect of land North West Of Holly Lodge (also known as Land at High Mass Cottage and Land at Church View), Five Lanes North, Five Lanes, Caerwent, Monmouthshire.

We noted that the application for an award of costs had been refused with regard to Appeal A and Appeal B.

**8. FOR INFORMATION: Appeals received 1st July to 30th September 2024**

We noted the planning appeals received by the Planning Department for the period 1st July to 30th September 2024.

**The meeting ended at 3.45 pm.**

This page is intentionally left blank